Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission March 14, 2019 - Meeting Minutes Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

Roll Call

Present: Chair Christopher Payne and Commissioners Jennifer Bridge, Sandra Carr, Lou Garapolo,

Rebecca Houze, David Sokol, and Aleksandra Tadic

Absent: Commissioners Tom Abrahamson, Darrick Gurski, Laura Jordahl, and Noel Weidner

Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

Attorney: Gregory Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

Agenda Approval

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the agenda; Second by Commissioner Garapolo; Motion approved 7-0.

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Bridge to approve draft minutes for February 14, 2019; Second by Commissioner Tadic; Motion approved 7-0.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve draft minutes for February 21, 2019; Second by Commissioner Garapolo; Motion approved 7-0.

Regular Agenda

A. HPC 2019-10: 819 Woodbine Ave (Emily and Justin Hartung): Certificate of Appropriateness for restoration of enclosed front porch, including restoring the roof to a hip roof and a small addition on the left side (Frank Lloyd Wright Prairie School of Architecture Historic District). Applicant attended the Architectural Review Committee meeting 2/27/19.

Chair Payne introduced the application and said that the applicant attended the January 27, 2019, Architectural Review Committee meeting. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Christopher Bremer, the architect, was in attendance. He explained the changes made to meet the Committee's recommendations.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner Sokol said it is a sensitive response given that it is not original to the house. Commissioner Houze thanked the applicant for providing a historic photograph. Chair Payne said that the design of the addition is subtle and appropriate.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition and widow alteration as proposed. Second by Commissioner Houze. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, and Chair Payne

NAY: None

B. HPC 2019-11: 130 S Taylor Ave (Matthew Warton): Certificate of Appropriateness for restoration and opening of a previously enclosed porch (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District). Applicant attended the Architectural Review Committee meeting 2/27/19.

Chair Payne introduced the application and said that the applicant attended the January 27, 2019 Architectural Review Committee meeting. Planner Trexler gave an overview of the project.

Cristian Gansari was in attendance on behalf of the architect. He explained the changes made to meet the Committee's recommendations and said that they may return to the Commission if they find alternate historic materials when they begin to remove elements of the porch.

Motion by Commissioner Bridge to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Tadic.

Commissioner Garapolo said that the plans look appropriate and he appreciates that the Committee's comments were addressed. Chair Payne concurred.

Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the window alterations as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, and Chair Payne

NAY: None

C. Advisory Review: 230 S Euclid Ave (Christopher and Anna Knight): Advisory Review for construction of new garage that will be visible from the street (existing garage not visible so demolition does not require a Certificate of Appropriateness) (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview of the project.

Carlo Ruth, the architect, was in attendance. He stated that an effort was made to ensure the garage is compatible with the house.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open the discussion; Second by Commissioner Tadic.

Commissioner Garapolo said the garage is proportional and he applauds the effort. Commissioners Sokol, Tadic, and Bridge agreed. Commissioner Carr said she appreciates the use of stucco to match the house, along with the use of windows and a roof pitch similar to that of the house. Commissioner Houze noted that the size is appropriate. Chair Payne agreed with the Commission's comments and said that the details and materials are also appropriate.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to request Village staff to forward an Advisory Review letter to the applicant containing Commission comments within 10 days. Second by Commissioner Sokol. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, and Chair Payne

NAY: None

D. Advisory Review: 225-233 N Ridgeland Ave (Dan Moroney): Advisory Review for construction of a new house on an empty lot adjacent to 229 N Ridgeland Ave (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District). Chair Payne introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview of the project.

Dan Moroney, property owner, was in attendance. He provided some background on the project and explained that he is looking to build something that doesn't look like a historic house but references the historic houses of the area.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open the discussion; second by Commissioner Garapolo.

The Commission discussed the location of the proposed house and its association with the adjacent two properties. The Commission largely agreed that having the front door on the east-west street rather than the north-south street was appropriate, but they suggested the east elevation be designed to look more like the other houses that front N Ridgeland Ave.

Several Commissioners expressed an interest in having the house reflect the Victorian era houses nearby rather than the Prairie style. Others suggested simplifying the design and borrowing more from the Prairie style, including emphasizing the horizontal lines, grouping windows rather than having them randomly spaced, and putting heavier materials like stone at the base of the house rather than the top.

The massing of the house was discussed and several Commissioners indicated concern about the house's size. However, Chair Payne said its corner location across the street from a church makes the massing less of a concern. The Commission discussed the garage, suggesting that that the garage wall might be improved by using larger windows. They suggested that separating the garage from the house may be more in keeping with the rhythm of the street.

Motion by Commissioner Tadic to request Village staff to forward an Advisory Review letter to the applicant containing Commission comments within 10 days. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Tadic, and Chair Payne

NAY: None

OTHER BUSINESS

Planner Trexler reminded the Commission that a hearing is scheduled on April 11 for the Certificate of Economic Hardship application on 1014 and 1018 Pleasant St.

ADJOURN

The meeting adjourned at 8:30PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Urban Planner Historic Preservation.