

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
May 11, 2017 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Christopher Payne, Greg Battoglia, Jennifer Bridge, Rebecca Houze, Laura Jordahl, David Sokol, Aleksandra Tadic
ABSENT: Darrick Gurski, Don McLean, Noel Weidner
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Houze to approve the agenda as submitted. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 7-0.
AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

Patrick Durgin, 834 Columbian, stated he has owned the home for three years and he has a sun room that is sinking and it needs to be rebuilt. His contractor Ken Floody suggested he come to this meeting to find out if he could remove it and build a new one. Chair Payne explained the process for submitting a Certificate of Appropriateness application along with the appropriate documentation showing the sun room required demolition rather than repair. This would then need to be submitted to staff to begin the review and approval process through the Commission.

MINUTES

Motion by Battoglia to approve the minutes of the April 13, 2017 meeting as submitted. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 7-0.
AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. Historic Landmark: Public Hearing for the following:**
209 Forest Avenue: James T. Hayden House (William K Johnston, 1893)
Property owner Holly Van Deursen was present.

Chair Payne opened the public hearing and noted that owner consent is on file with the Village.
Motion by Battoglia to accept the nomination report for 209 Forest Avenue as the Findings of Fact under criteria (3), (5) and (6) as submitted. Second by Bridge.

Planner Kaarre read the list of exhibits.

There was no public comment in support or against the nomination.

Property owner Holly Van Deursen was present and in support. It was on the Wright Plus house walk ten years ago, which is where they got a lot of their research.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that it clearly meets the criteria outlined in the nomination report.

Commissioner Sokol stated that he lives around the corner and it is a pleasure seeing the house and how well it is taken care of.

Chair Payne stated that it is a fantastic home.

Commissioner Houze stated that it is a beautiful house with interesting history and an interesting lesser-known architect.

Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne

NAY: None

Motion by Sokol to forward a Resolution and the Findings of Fact for 209 Forest Avenue to the Village Board of Trustees for approval as a Historic Landmark. Second by Houze. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne

NAY: None

Motion by Battoglia to close the public hearing. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne

NAY: None

B. HPC 2017-23: 109 S. Taylor Avenue (Franken): Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a rear two-story stucco coach house and construct of one-story frame vinyl-clad garage (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)

Property owner Beth Franken was present.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The house at 109 S. Taylor Avenue is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The front two-flat (recently converted into a single-family house) was constructed in 1915, and the coach house was constructed in 1923. The proposal is to demolish the two-story stucco coach house based on its physical condition, which is claimed to be too costly to repair. The applicant met with the Architectural Review Committee at its meeting on April 26. The Committee noted that the high estimates for repair were due to the fact that there was a second-floor apartment, and that a structural conditions report would be required for further analysis. The structural report outlining the current physical conditions of the coach house was submitted after the required submittal deadline and has not been reviewed by Staff. Although this was permitted to allow the request to move forward, staff has no recommendation at this time.

Beth Franken stated that she is rehabbing the property to sell. She did not want to tear the coach house down, but she had a former member of the Historic Preservation Commission look at it, and they said it needs to come down. It will be a liability to the new owner. She can't pass it on and needs to take care of it. She can't separate out the apartment from the garage.

Motion by Sokol to open the application for discussion. Second by Houze.

Commissioner Jordahl stated that the coach house has no foundation and undersized steel joists. It sounds precarious, along with the amount of money needed to put back in. The only recourse sounds like demolition. That is her read of the documentation.

Chair Payne stated that the applicant has submitted a structural report but no financial comparisons. He clarified the discussion from the Architectural Review Committee meeting regarding separating the apartment from the garage in the analysis report. However, that may not be needed here due to the condition of the building. The second part of the discussion now is the proposed new garage. The Architectural Review Guidelines note that the new garage should be compatible with the main structure in material and roof slope. The proposed garage will be clad with vinyl, which is not compatible.

Beth Franken stated that she has studied the ordinance and the new garage will not be visible from the street and so the Commission should not be able to tell her what to do with the new garage. Vinyl siding is cheaper.

The Commission discussed the ordinance and definition of "Visible from the Street," as well as the site plan, and agreed that the new garage would not be visible from the street. They recommended that the new garage be clad with stucco to make it compatible with the house.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the rear two-story coach house at 109 S. Taylor Avenue. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battaglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne

NAY: None

C. HPC 2017-25: 804 Forest Avenue (Daniel): Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition, remove a one-story attached garage, construct a rear detached garage, remove siding and install fiber cement board siding on the second floor (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)

Property owner Jeremy Daniel Nelson and Architect Drew Nelson were present

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The house at 804 Forest Avenue is a Contributing Resource within the *Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*. The house was constructed in 1925 and the 1-car attached garage was constructed in 1954. The second floor was covered with asbestos siding at some point in the mid-20th century. It is thought to be stucco underneath, as the original building permit states that the house is identical to 612 Belleforte, which was also built by the same developer John C. Hattendorf. The Architectural Review Committee met with the Architect at its April 26 meeting. The Committee was supportive of the removal of the tandem garage, construction of the new rear detached stucco garage, and construction of the rear two-story addition. There was discussion about the second-floor siding, as it had not been clearly identified as to what was underneath the asbestos. The Committee recommended further investigation and suggested staff look at the original permit. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to demolish the one-story side garage addition, construct a rear one-story stucco garage, construct a rear two-story addition, and remove the second floor asbestos siding and restore the stucco cladding to match the existing stucco, per Section 7-9-13(E) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Drew Nelson, WDN Architecture, stated that they looked further under the asbestos siding and are planning to restore the stucco on the second floor of the house.

Motion by Battaglia to open the application for discussion. Second by Tadic.

Commissioner Battaglia stated that the application meets the Architectural Review Guidelines and should be approved.

Commissioner Tadic stated that she was happy they were restoring the stucco.

Chair Payne suggested they look into restoring the divided light windows, at least on the front of the house. It was the same developer as 612 Belleforte, which still has its original 3/1 windows.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition, remove a one-story attached garage, construct a rear detached garage, remove siding and restore stucco on the second floor at 804 Forest Avenue as submitted in drawings prepared by WDN Architecture dated May 3, 2017. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battaglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- D. **HPC 2017-26: 228 S. Humphrey Avenue (Najera): Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear mudroom/porch addition, construct a south dormer addition, and alter window openings on the first floor north side (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)**
Property owner Alisa Najera and architect Rosanne McGrath were present.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The house at 228 S. Humphrey Avenue is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The house was likely constructed c. 1895 based on its Queen Anne architecture. There are no original permits on file and no Sanborn map coverage for this neighborhood in 1895. The proposed rear one-story addition and gabled dormer meet the Guidelines in terms of size, scale set-back, massing, materials, location, character and roof design. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application for construction of a rear one-story addition, south-facing gabled dormer, and north-facing window alterations, per Section 7-9-13(E) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Alisa Najera stated that they are new owners and are excited to bring the house back.

Motion by Sokol to open the application for discussion. Second by Tadic.

Rosanne McGrath, Studio M Architects, provided an overview of the plans and elevations. They are proposing a small dormer on the south-facing roof slope at the rear of the house facing Randolph Street. They are adding a one-story mud-room addition on the rear of the house. They are altering two windows on the north elevations that won't be visible from the street.

Commissioner Battaglia stated that the project meets the Architectural Review Guidelines. He asked why staff couldn't approve the project administratively.

Planner Kaarre stated that the project is on a corner and the addition and dormer are visible from the street.

Motion by Battaglia to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear mudroom/porch addition, construct a south dormer addition, and alter window openings on the first floor north side at 228 S. Humphrey Avenue as submitted in drawings prepared by Studio M Architects dated April 21, 2017 . Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battaglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- E. **HPC 2017-27: 1020 Superior Street (Pantazopoulos + Beckenhauer): Certificate of Appropriateness to construct two-story side and rear additions and rear one-story garage – revised (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**
Architect Chris Wollmuth was present.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The house at 1020 Superior is a Contributing Resource within the Historic District. The house was constructed c. 1890 and was altered in 1919 with the two front porch additions and side addition, which was likely when it was clad in stucco, giving the house a Craftsman-style appearance. The proposal involves a two-story addition on the rear, east and west sides of the house. The two-story side addition stepping out behind the side bay on the east will be the most visible of the two. The addition will be clad in stucco to match the house. According to the architect, the front portion of the house is remaining stucco, but the addition is switching to a combination of a stucco base, board and batten body and shingles at the gable peaks as well as certain accents. The siding would be cement board, prefinished in a tone-on-tone color scheme to match the existing. They are using the stucco base to unify the home, with the board and batten to

complement the stucco, with the shingles as an accent to help break up the expanses of board and batten. The proposal also involves changing the siding on the new detached garage from stucco to vertical board fiber cement board siding to match the new siding on the rear addition. The architect met with the Architectural Review Committee at their meeting on April 26. The Committee was supportive of the changes to the project. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to construct additions on the rear, east and west facades, and to change the siding on the rear garage from stucco to vertical board and batten fiber cement board siding, per Section 7-9-13(E) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Chris Wollmuth provided an overview of the project. The bump out was moved from the back to the west side. The front will remain entirely stucco. The eaves will be changed to EIFS for constructability. The sides will be a three-part scheme, with the stucco at the base, the board-and-batten on the body and the shingles in the gables and as an accent to break the scale down. The garage, which has been moved up, will match the main body of the house.

Motion by Battoglia to open the application for discussion. Second by Tadic.

Commissioner Sokol stated that they have made a substantial effort to meet the Commission's concerns.

Motion by Jordahl to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to construct two-story side and rear additions and rear one-story garage at 1020 Superior Street as submitted in drawings prepared by CW Design dated May 3, 2017 . Second by Battoglia. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne

NAY: None

F. HPC 2017-28: 726 N. East Avenue (Smith/Rhodes): Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate the front entry porch (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)

Architect Chris Wollmuth was present.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The house at 726 N. East is a Contributing Resource within the Historic District. The house was likely constructed c. 1905 as it appears on the 1908 Sanborn map (there is a 1914 building permit for a two-story frame residence at this address also). The existing one-story enclosed front porch is not original to the house. The porch is not shown on the 1908 Sanborn map, and is apparently not on the 1930 map. The proposal is to open the front porch and move the side entry stairs to the front and add railings around the top of the side walls. The architect met with the Architectural Review Committee at their meeting on February 22. The Committee recommended keeping the stairs to the side, as that is in keeping with the Prairie style of architecture. The 1908 Sanborn map shows that the house originally had some type of side enclosure, possibly an entry porch. It's unknown at this point. The architecture of the house is in the Prairie style, as is the later porch addition, with the stucco side walls and side entry. The wide open front entry stairs and porch railings is a departure from that style, even though it is a later addition. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to open the front porch and add new stairs, per Section 7-9-13(E) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, with the following conditions:

- Leave the stucco side walls in place when opening the porch
- Add or re-do the stairs on the side of the porch

Chris Wollmuth provided an overview of the project. The driveway for the house is on the north side and the entry is on the south side of the house. It is a bit awkward as some people would knock on the side door along the driveway. That was the origin of the project. The look was to shift the entry to

the front of the home, make it more visual and connect it more visually to the street. They would knock out the stucco wall on the front of the porch. They would remove the screens and add a knee-railling along the top of the stucco wall to bring it up to code. They would fill in where they removed the current stairs. He discussed with the owners regarding whether the original entry was on the front or side. The existing porch was added after 1930. The entry is off-center, but there is nothing to indicate there was ever a side entry. They feel it is open to interpretation. They looked at other examples of Craftsman styles with front entry porches, which is how they arrived at this design.

Motion by Jordahl to open the application for discussion. Second by Battoglia.

Commissioner Battoglia thanked him for his presentation. He is confused about the entry door and its location. The 1908 Sanborn map seems to show it on the side.

Chris Wollmuth states that he's not sure if that is indicating an entry, and that space is only 2-feet deep, so that may not be a porch. It was unclear in interpretation.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that since they don't know when the porch was constructed, what is the end of the period of significance of the historic district.

Planner Kaarre stated that it is 1941.

Chris Wollmuth stated that the last Sanborn map the Historical Society has is 1930, and the porch is not on that map.

The Commission reviewed the various porch examples provided.

Commissioner Sokol stated that he doesn't hear anything to refute the architect's proposal.

Chair Payne agreed, stated that he doesn't know what was there originally, and what is proposed is compatible.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate the front entry porch at 726 N. East Avenue as submitted in drawings prepared by CW Design dated November 14, 2016 . Second by Tadic. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- G. HPC 2017-29: 204 S. Scoville Avenue (Ashton): Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear one-story addition, new dormer, demolish rear stucco garage and construct new garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**
Architect Tom Bassett-Dilley was present.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The house at 204 S. Scoville Avenue is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The *Mrs. H. L. Jewell House* was constructed in 1906 and designed by architect E. E. Roberts in the Prairie style. The house is on the Commission's Potential Landmark Inventory. The rear one-car stucco garage was constructed in 1916. The proposed rear one- and two-story additions and rear dormer are compatible with the house in terms of location, size, material and character and meet the Guidelines. The existing garage has been shown to be technically infeasible to repair based upon the garage inspection report submitted. The design of the coach house is compatible with the house in scale, massing, material and character. The roof profile is modern, but the structure is compatible overall. Staff recommends

approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to construct a rear one- and two-story addition, rear dormer addition, demolish the rear one-story garage, and construct a rear two-story coach house, per Section 7-9-13(E) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Tom Bassett-Dilley stated that all of the proposed work is in the rear. He provided an overview of the plans and elevations. The house is on a double lot. They are extending the first floor to the back a little bit and opening it to the deck. They are adding a second bedroom on the second floor and using a gabled roof through a new dormer. The new work is a cedar lattice and extending the language of the house, stucco, cedar trim band and new stucco coach house. The existing garage has no foundation and is heaving, and the slab is cracked. There was a rear addition that is being removed and then extended.

Motion by Sokol to open the application for discussion. Second by Houze.

Commissioner Sokol stated that it makes sense to conform.

Commissioner Houze asked if the rear study was original.

Tom Bassett-Dilley stated that it may be original or historic. It has old wood trim.

Commissioner Tadic stated that it is a beautiful house. The foundation fits well. The delineation between old and new is subtle.

Tom Bassett-Dilley stated the addition is not stepping back but there is a visual break on the second floor.

Chair Payne stated that it is extremely subtle.

Commissioner Houze stated that she is hesitant to put a big addition on a potential landmark, though it is a beautiful design. She asked if it would compromise the ability to landmark it.

Chair Payne stated that he did not believe so. His only concern is creating the double windows on the north façade.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that the coach house is a great example of being compatible without being literal.

Commissioner Tadic stated that she is excited to see it constructed.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear one-story addition, new dormer, demolish a rear stucco garage and construct a new coach house at 204 S. Scoville Avenue as submitted in drawings prepared by TBDA dated May 3, 2017 . Second by Battoglia. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne

NAY: None

- H. **HPC 2017-30: 738 N. Oak Park Avenue (Buckley/Las): Certificate of Advisory Review to construct a two-story side addition on a Non-Contributing Resource (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**
Property owner Jennifer Las was present.

Planner Kaarre presented the staff report. The property at 738 N. Oak Park Avenue is a Modern split-level design clad in stone and horizontal wood plank siding. The property is listed as a Non-Contributing Resource because it was constructed after 1941, the end of the period of significance for the historic district. Section 7-9-16.C of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that the Commission may make recommendations concerning revisions to the proposed work which will bring the work into conformity with review criteria set forth in the ordinance. Following Commission review, the applicant is free to either revise their plans in accordance with the suggested changes and submit them to the Permit Processing Division, or to submit them without change, and the permit will be issued if the application is otherwise in compliance with Village Code.

Commissioner Jordahl asked if they removed the stone from the house due to building code reasons.

Jennifer Las stated that they removed the stone for aesthetic reasons.

Commissioner Houze asked what type of stone they planned to install on the house.

Jennifer Las stated it was a thin slate type of stone.

The remaining commission members had no comments.

- I. **HPC 2017-31: 109 S. Scoville Avenue (N. Daniel): Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish rear roof and side gables and rebuild new and larger roof and gables, remove chimney, replace siding and windows (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)**
Architect Ryan Hardy was present.

Planner Kaarre presented the staff report. The house at 109 S. Scoville Avenue is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The house was constructed c. 1898. The proposal is to remove the cementitious siding and restore the original wood siding underneath, as well as the original exposed siding on the front. The proposal also involves repairing/restoring the original wood windows on the front façade, and assessing the other wood windows on the sides for repair or replacement. Finally, the proposal involves a rear third floor addition, which will replace the side gables with dormers, allowing for a raised rear addition. The applicant and her architect met with the Architectural Review Committee at their April 26 meeting, and this was the direction recommended by the committee. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to restore the exterior siding and windows, repair or replace some windows with wood clad windows to match, and construct a side and rear third floor addition, per Section 7-9-13(E) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Ryan Hardy provided an overview of the project. They want to maintain the habitability of the third floor space but the roof rafters are not the right size. They are following the recommendations of the Architectural Review Committee by maintaining the front and raising the back and sides up. They moved the stair to the center. They are restoring the original wood siding on the front and removing the cementitious siding. They are restoring the existing original windows. Those windows that are not original they are replacing with aluminum-clad wood windows to match the original ones. It still maintains the character of the neighborhood and allows them to use the third-floor space.

Motion by Sokol to open the application for discussion. Second by Battoglia.

Commissioner Sokol stated that it looks like a good solution to a difficult problem.

Chair Payne stated that he appreciates the work done to maintain the front façade, and they end up with a good compromise.

Motion by Tadic to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the rear roof and side gables and rebuild a new a larger roof and gables, remove chimney, replace siding and windows at 109 S. Scoville Avenue as submitted in drawings prepared by Ryan Hardy dated May 8, 2017 .
Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Houze, Jordahl, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne
NAY: None

J. Oak Park Post Office, 901 Lake Street:

Commissioner Sokol stated that he met with Postmaster Crawford and they had an interesting meeting. All are concerned about this important building. The second floor is now completely empty. They have made refinements to allow access without opening the interior of the building. They have been in contact with philanthropists and there is no money. The post office can't take private money. The head of the Congressional Appropriations Committee that oversees the Post Office now Congressman Chaffetz from Utah. Postmaster Crawford welcomes any help. He needs help with grounds/beautification. He knows that sandblasting the building is bad. They should reach out to the Manager's office regarding the financial issue. The postal service works on bonuses to keep costs down. They should explore through Chaffetz's office and contact Brad White through the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation.

K. Architectural Review Guidelines:

The commission discussed the definition of "Visible from the Street." They also discussed the Advisory Review process. They should use the Guidelines to make comments on Non-Contributing properties.

L Acting Chair:

Motion by Sokol to election Laura Jordahl as Acting Chair. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 6-0.
AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Houze, Sokol, Tadic, Chair Payne
NAY: None

CONSENT AGENDA

None

OTHER BUSINESS

- Architectural Review Committee
- Education Committee: Commissioner Bridge updated the Commission on current activities, including work on updating the Guide Book to the FLW Historic District, the Guidelines and the Post Office

ADJOURN

Motion by Bridge to adjourn. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 9-0.
AYE: Battoglia, Bridge, Gurski, Houze, Jordahl, McLean, Tadic, Weidner, Chair Payne
NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 9:45 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner.