

# Historic Preservation Commission Architectural Review Committee

Wednesday, August 24, 2016 Oak Park Village Hall, 123 Madison Street Room 215, 7:30 p.m.

#### Roll Call-

Present: Greg Battoglia, Laura Jordahl, Regina Nally, Chris Payne, Aleksandra Tadic

### Regular Agenda

A. <u>733 N. Kenilworth Avenue (Buoscio)</u>: Construct a one-story south side addition on a two-story house (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

This project was originally presented at last meeting. Based on ARC recommendations owner tailored back addition; last pass had flat roof, but now has a gable. There are two versions of gable, and added a connecting element between the original house and addition. Commissioner Nally felt there have been significant positive changes since the last go around; the owner has tried to achieve a contemporary feel, which the ARC didn't have issues with, but the ARC wanted elements added to make the project more acceptable. The roof change is an improvement. The connector element a plus, as it pulls the addition away and makes it a separate entity. However, now that the forms of the addition reflect some of the forms of the original house, the addition seems to compete with it. Abstracted forms in the addition derived from the home create a tension.

Commissioner Payne noted that it meets three of the Guidelines: siting, massing and scale; but two aren't satisfied. It lacks a strong stone base that the former design included. A gable is present, but it is so radically different from the original. Perhaps treat it as a gazebo, pavilion or conservatory; this approach would be more successful. Scale is also odd. Look more carefullly at the way it hits the ground; include the base. The back of building seems to be more aligned with the house than the front.

The owner loves the idea of a pavilion design, with cedar and glazing. Commissioner Tadic confers w/owner that this use of materials was what the ARC was hoping to retain, though moving the front stair to the side or back was preferred, so that addition stairs won't compete with the house stairs. Owner wants to add a window on the side of the original house; this window will be a duplicate of window in the front within the same room.

B. <u>835 N. Grove Avenue (Cultra)</u>: Construct a two-story south side addition on a two-story house (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)

Addition is set back 12 feet from the front façade. The windows are different from the original, unsure why. Picks up the base, hoizontal lines, gables, windows are proportional to the home. They would like to remove the original siding underneath and replace with cement board. Commissioner Nally recognized the high cost of removal, along with going against the ordinance. Features of the addition are a completely different vernacular from the original house style. They are adding the stick ornament, vertical muntin bars to the addition windows, changing from simple farmhouse to a craftsman sort of home.

Commissioner Payne felt they were creating a false sense of history with changing vernacular elements. Is there a site plan? There aren't any, or very few homes with a substantial side addition on this block. Concern: is the scale of the addition too large, relative to the rest of the street?

Commissioner Nally brought up the one-third massing issue in the New Addition Policy, relative to the adjacent properties. <u>Recommendations</u>: Maintain the existing siding, simplify the architectural elements, taking cues from original, lot width-to-building width ratio, with perhaps a deeper setback. Check with Doug re: records of covering the original siding, which they believe existing is aluminum.

C. <u>228 Clinton Avenue (Ravitts Woodworth)</u>: Demolish a one-story, 3-car stucco garage and construct a two-story, 4-car stucco coach house (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)

Frank Heitzman stated that the two-family residence built in 1894 was converted to a Prairie style; the owner Randi Woodworth (who was present) is in the midst of comprehensive renovation of the two-flat home. Coach house will be used as a social dance company space, recreation. Existing garage doesn't have footings, most of the concrete parking will be removed from the back yard, the driveway will remain for one bay. New garage seems to satisfy the ordinance, aside from the change in the roof from hip to gable. Commissioner Nally would like to see the dormers more substantial relative to the elevations. All suggested that dormers should be centered on the triple windows.

D. <u>233 S. East Avenue (Chris Wollmuth)</u>: Rear two-story addition, one-story side addition. pitched roof alteration, new windows (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)

Chris Wollmuth stated that the owners would like to change windows, change the flat roof of the front porch to a pitched roof, take advantage of the wide side lot; and create an addition to maximize the interior flow.

Commissioner Tadic noted that the front façade is a great improvement, the windows most likely not original.

Commissioner Payne stated that research is going to be important. They may find that the front porch is not original, windows perhaps changed over time. This matters to the ordinance as far as changes are concerned.

Commissioner Nally noted that closer details in the photos will help us to tell a more accurate story.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that the new side entry competes with the chimney, whereas the original is set back. Differentiation of the massing from old to new should be made, according to the New Addition Policy. There will need to be a small setback, or step back, to comply.

E. <u>1020 Superior Street (Chris Wollmuth)</u>: Rear two-story addition, demolish rear one-car garage and construct rear two-car garage (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

Chris Wollmuth stated that the owners would like to get rid of most of the concrete. Some of the concrete remains from the neighbor's access to their garage, though the neighbors have rebuilt their garage, so don't need the surface. Original house was built in 1890 as a Victorian. Shortly thereafter the siding was removed and stuccoed over. The stucco is in very bad shape. The owners will need to decide whether to restucco, or change the siding to the original, if it was clapboard.

Commissioner Nally stated that historic photos would help tremendously. They would help us better digest how the many elements of the building interact, and then direct the garage.

Commissioner Payne asked if the garage is original. Might be worth adding onto the exisiting. What is the condition? Exterior is stucco, and it is old.

Commissioner Nally Noted that the new gable of the back of the addition dying into the existing one is very odd. Reconnect with Doug about the historical elements, such as the siding, and the changes over the years.

#### **Other Business**

None

## <u>Adjourn</u>

Motion by Battoglia to adourn. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 5-0. Meeting adjourned at 9:30 p.m. Minutes prepared by Laura Jordahl.