Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission August 11, 2016 Meeting Minutes

Oak Park Village Hall, Room 201 - Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Acting Chair Regina Nally, Greg Battoglia, Rebecca Houze, Laura Jordahl, Christopher

Payne, David Sokol, Aleksandra Tadic

Fred Brandstrader, Don McLean, Dan Moroney ABSENT:

STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Battoglia to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 7-0. AYE: Battoglia, Houze, Jordahl, Payne, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Nally

NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Sokol to approve the minutes of the June 28, 2016 meeting as submitted. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Houze, Jordahl, Payne, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Nally

NAY: None

Motion by Jordahl to approve the minutes of the July 14, 2016 meeting as submitted. Second by Payne. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Houze, Jordahl, Payne, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Nally

NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

A. HPC 2016-39: 159 N. Cuyler Avenue (Scianna): Construct a second floor addition and side mudroom addition on a one-story bungalow (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District) Architect John Schiess was present

Planner Kaarre presented the staff report. Staff recommended approval of the COA as submitted.

John Schiess provided an overview of the application. As the only one-story, 2-bedroom home on the block, the house continually falls into disinvestment. They are proposing to expand the house to a 4bedroom house with a 3-car garage. They are treating the side entry like a bay. They lowered the second floor addition roof and pulled the front wall back further, per the recommendation of the ARC. The addition will be clad with wood siding.

Motion by Battoglia to open the application for discussion. Second by Sokol.

Commission Sokol noted that adding a floor addition changes the overall character of a bungalow. However, in this particular context and block it is a satisfying solution.

Acting Chair Nally noted that moving the front wall of the addition back makes a big difference. A perspective drawing would have helped. This is as sensitive as this type of addition can be.

Commissioner Payne agreed that adding a floor alters the character. He appreciates the attention to the front windows and the porch. They are keeping within the style and materials.

Motion by Payne to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the second floor addition and side mudroom additions at 159 N. Cuyler Avenue as submitted, as they meet the New Addition Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines. Second by Jordahl. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Houze, Jordahl, Payne, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Nally

NAY: None

B. <u>HPC 2016-45: 414 N. Elmwood (Stenstrom)</u>: Certificate of Appropriateness to replace a wood shingle roof with asphalt shingles (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

Property owner Eric Stenstrom was present.

Planner Kaarre presented the staff report. Staff recommended approval of the COA pending approval of the replacement material at the meeting.

Eric Stenstrom provided an overview of the application. He outlined the roof conditions, costs and need for replacement.

Motion by Battoglia to open the application for discussion. Second by Sokol.

The Commission noted that the shingles proposed are a similar size, shape and color per the Guidelines.

Commissioner Payne noted that they need to look at the Historic Preservation Ordinance closer in the future. He outlined the difference between wood shingles (straight lines) and wood shakes (mottled look), colors (red, green vs. browns). Historically the houses in Oak Park would have had wood shingles – often in red or green colors, but today everyone is using asphalt shingles to look like wood shakes in a brown color. If the HPC really wants to be accurate, they should be approving shingles that match what was there originally.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of the wood shingle roof with GAF Timberline HD Mission Brown asphalt shingles, as submitted, as it meets the Roofing Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 7-0. AYE: Battoglia, Houze, Jordahl, Payne, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Nally NAY: None

C. <u>HPC 2016-48: 831 N. Grove (Binning/Farina)</u>: Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear one-story addition, demolish a rear one-story garage and construct a two-story garage (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

Property owner Darrell Binning and architect Mark Zinni were present.

Planner Kaarre presented the staff report. Staff recommended approval of the COA as submitted.

Mark Zinni provided an overview of the application. The owner has revised the project based on the HPC's 5-4 vote at the June meeting. They listened to what you had to say. They are now proposing a one-story addition and are adding additional space in a new two-story garage.

Motion by Sokol to open the application for discussion. Second by Tadic.

Commissioner Tadic noted that they are happy it is remaining a bungalow. The garage is more substantial but has low visibility from the street. She thanked the owner for listening – there will be some bungalows left in Oak Park.

Commissioner Payne noted that this is one of the nicer bungalows in Oak Park and is a fantastic addition. He appreciates the design of the new garage.

Commissioner Battoglia stated that it is amazing they got approval for a second floor addition but still came back with this smaller addition.

Acting Chair Nally thanked them, and cited this as a future example to share with other owners.

Motion by Battoglia to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a rear one-story addition, demolition of a rear one-story garage and construction of a rear two-story garage, with the addition of trim board on the north elevaton, as it meets the New Addition Policy and Garage Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines. Second by Sokol. Motion approved 7-0. AYE: Battoglia, Houze, Jordahl, Payne, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Nally NAY: None

D. <u>HPC 2012-10: 100-106 S. Oak Park Avenue (106 Partners LLC)</u>: Request for approval of completion for the Cook County Class L Designation Consultant Cliff Osborn was present.

Motion by Jordahl that on August 11, 2016 the Historic Preservation Commission officially determined that the approved project has now been completed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standard's for Rehabilitation and the Village of Oak Park's Architectural Review Guidelines. Second by Sokol. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Battoglia, Houze, Jordahl, Payne, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Nally

NAY: None

CONSENT AGENDA

OTHER BUSINESS

<u>Rosanne McGrath</u>: Recognize former Commissioner and Chair. The Commission formally Rosanne for her dedication and years of service to the Commission. She also went over some of the projects she was working on that remained unfinished.

ADJOURN

Motion by Sokol to adjourn. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 7-0. AYE: Battoglia, Houze, Jordahl, Payne, Sokol, Tadic, Acting Chair Nally NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 9:20 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner/Historic Preservation.