

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE
August 4, 2016 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Room 215, 7:30 pm

A. Roll Call

PRESENT: Acting Chair Regina Nally, Chris Payne, Aleksandra Tadic
ABSENT: Greg Battoglia
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

B. 204 N. Ridgeland (Gaudett): Front porch addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)
Architect Errol Kirsch was present representing the property owner.

Errol Kirsch stated that the existing canopy would remain with no substantial changes to the trim. It would have a flat roof with two columns. They would repeat the decorative scallop elements. They would replace the concrete stoop and metal railings. The owners would like some cover from the elements on the front porch.

Commissioner Payne noted that there is no demolition so the review would be Advisory.

Acting Chair Nally stated that it would be a significant change to a simple façade. Adding a porch on the front creates a new character element contrary to the design of the building, even though you are making every effort to minimize the impact and changes to the house.

The Committee asked that the drawings show materials and details.

C. 733 N. Kenilworth Avenue (Buoscio): Construct a one-story south side addition on a two-story house (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)
Property owner Phil Buoscio was present.

Phil Buoscio stated that he is a real estate broker and general contractor. They just moved to Oak Park into this 1890 two-flat. He would like to construct a side addition for his family. He wants an inspiring modern design with eco values that is compatible to a Victorian house. It is setback behind the bay, more than 30 feet from the street. The scale is tied to the vocabulary of what's there. It's small in size. It has a symmetrical front façade; the covered porches on both tie them together. Banding ties with the line of the rear pitched roof. Both porches have shed roofs with large overhangs. He would like to discuss materials such as cedar and stucco.

Commissioner Nally asked if both doors would access the first floor unit.

Phil Buoscio stated yes, it will allow them the use of the yard. The pitched roof on the addition is for the use of solar panels as a second option if he can't use them on the house.

Commissioner Nally stated that he should find contemporary ideas of historic styles. The proposed design is very foreign to the house. It's a nice composition, but it competes with the house.

Phil Buoscio stated that he is trying to do something new.

Commissioner Payne discussed the interface with the bay and stepping it back at the roof. A modern design could work here since there is a large yard and with the right materials. The front stair and door disrupt the rhythm on the street and makes it look like multiple dwellings on the lot. Consider a recessed side stair. Consider a flat roof. Look at making a better connection with the house.

Commissioner Tadic stated that its great he's "going green." The transition is better, as is the glazing.

The Committee discussed the addition setback and whether there should be a front porch. They recommended looking at creating a transition between the house and addition, such as a "hyphen" or "notch" connecting them utilizing glazing. They used Van Bergen examples. They noted that they will ultimately require floor plans and that the elevations will need dimensions and materials.

- D. **414 N. Elmwood Avenue (Stenstrom): Replace a wood shingle roof with asphalt shingles (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**
Property owner Eric Stenstrom was present.

Eric Stenstrom noted he is a design professional, and that the wood shingle roof was inspected by Wiss Janney Elstner (WJE) and they recommended composite shingles, flat in the middle with membrane. He is proposing architectural grade shingles. He supplied three quotes. WJE are roofing experts. AllState inspected after some roof damage and will be providing some repair money from wind, hail and squirrels. There are copper valleys. The proposal is to use architectural grade in a Mission Brown color. The wood shingles may only be about 15 years old. This was the first house built on the block in 1889, designed by Patton & Fisher. He would have to redo the copper valleys with new cedar.

Commissioner Nally stated that it's a shame to lose the cedar. Even a nice architectural shingle will not replicate it. He did choose nice examples.

The Committee asked him to look into the following information:

- What was the original roofing material on the house?
- Provide cost estimates for repair, new cedar and new asphalt
- Submit the list of successfully completed projects by roofer

A. **159 N. Cuyler Avenue (Scianna): Construct a second floor addition on a one-story bungalow (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)**

Architect John Schiess was present via conference call.

John Schiess provided an overview of the history of the project. It's the only bungalow on the block and only has two bedrooms. It has been sitting vacant for a while. They have made changes requested by the ARC by lowering the height by 1'-7" and setting it back further 4 feet (it is now 61 feet from the street). The side mudroom addition is setback 6 feet from the south. It provides an entrance to the basement. They did look at lowering the roof and adding dormers, but it would have eliminated too much headroom and so would not have worked as an alternative. This proposal is as low as it can get and meet code.

Commissioner Payne noted that they attempted to meet the ARC's recommendations. He would prefer it further back, but he appreciates the restoration of the front character. It's a better design.

Commissioner Nally noted that the proportions are better.

Commissioner Payne stated that he has a problem with the mudroom. The one-car garage addition ruined the character, and removing it was a great idea, but putting something back doesn't fix the problem. It maintains the old massing and keeps a second door. Treat it more like a bay with only a rear entry. Encroachment would look more appropriate – minimize and integrate.

John Schiess agreed that two front doors are a little awkward. He could look at changing to a side door. He can't move to the rear due to the stairs.

Commissioner Tadic noted that all bungalows have side doors.

Commissioner Payne suggested ideas on looking like a bay or adding a hip roof – integrate it into the roofline, but don't use a shed roof.

Commissioner Nally noted that the front porch design looks out of place like a shotgun house.

John Schiess agreed it is not elegant and may have been changed. He can pull it back some. The siding material will be 3-1/2 inch wood siding and will distinguish old from new.

The Committee had a discussion on a change in materials or really a change in dimensions.

Commissioner Tadic noted that the front dormer really helps reduce the massing.

B. **303 N. Grove Avenue (Gaudett): Demolish a one-story frame garage and construct a one-story frame garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**

The property owner was not present.

The Committee noted that a new garage should replicate the existing in scale, massing and details such as hip roof, etc.

E. Minutes

Motion by Payne to approve the June 22, 2016 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 3-0.

F. Zoning Ordinance Design Standards: Review proposed design standards in comparison to the New Building Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines

The Committee discussed Advisory Review for new construction in historic districts and the new design review standards for commercial buildings. Who will review projects and under which guidelines will they be reviewed when they are in historic districts? Will projects get reviewed twice? The HPC will not want to relinquish their Advisory Review process as it the only input they have outside of the Certificate of Appropriateness Review process. Everyone agreed the design standards seem comprehensive enough.

ADJOURN

Motion by Payne to adjourn. Second by Tadic. Motion approved 3-0.

Meeting adjourned at 10:30 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner.