

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
November 12, 2015 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers/Room 201, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Greg Battoglia, Don McLean, Dan Moroney, Regina Nally, Vice Chair Gary Palese, Chris Payne, David Sokol
ABSENT: Fred Brandstrader, Laura Jordahl, Tony Quinn
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Battoglia to approve the meeting agenda. Second by Palese. Motion approved 8-0.
AYE: Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Payne to approve the October 8, 2015 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Battoglia. Motion approved 8-0.
AYE: Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. **HPC 2015-59: South + Harlem Development (OP South Boulevard LLC): Planned Development application to construct a 12-story mixed-use building to replace parking and vacant lots (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)**
Joseph Segobiano, Lincoln Properties, was present representing the applicant

Planner Kaarre introduced the application. The proposed Planned Development will construct a 12-story mixed-use building at the southeast corner of Harlem Avenue and South Boulevard. The development is partially located within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*, although no buildings remain on the site.

Section 7-9-10 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that for Planned Development projects within historic districts, the Historic Preservation Commission “*shall evaluate the anticipated effect of the zoning action requested in the application on the designated historic district and shall consider the long-term compatibility of the proposed zoning action with the character of the affected historic resources and the effect of any proposed zoning action on the long-range preservation of these resources.*”

The ordinance also states that the Commission “*may present its evaluation or opinion on the effects of such anticipated zoning action on an historic district to the board or commission hearing such zoning action.*” This memo constitutes the comments of the Historic Preservation Commission with regard to the anticipated effect of the project on the historic district.

Joseph Segobiano, Lincoln Property Company, presented the development application. He reviewed the perspective drawings, discussed the zoning issues, and reviewed the floor plans for the 12-story building which will include a green roof.

November 12, 2015 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

The adjacent property to the south at 109-111 S. Maple Avenue was discussed. Mr. Segobiano noted that they are still willing to buy the property. The Commission discussed Certificate of Appropriateness procedures for the demolition of a Contributing Resource within a historic district.

The Historic Preservation Commission had the following comments which they forwarded to the Plan Commission for consideration:

- Create a more hospitable and pedestrian-friendly experience along the South Boulevard and Harlem Avenue facades by continuing the glass storefront system along South Boulevard. This could be achieved regardless of the interior use. Harlem Avenue is an extremely busy street with a very narrow sidewalk and busy bus stop on the corner. Consider ways to improve the pedestrian experience along Harlem Avenue by creating additional space through setting the façade back at the street level or creating a notch at the corner.
- Invest more attention to the south façade of the building and its relationship with the adjacent historic buildings. Look at ways to minimize the massing and be more respectful to the residential neighbors to the south by providing a more visual interaction and a more gradual transition. The walls of the parking garage facing the residences to the south are at a scale that is less than sympathetic. The south façade should be more than just the back of the building. Utilizing a small strip of green space will have little overall effect in buffering the project, and should be used in conjunction with other design tools to soften the transition.
- Consider ways to improve the pedestrian experience along the walkway that extends through the building where Maple Avenue currently sits. Improvements could include public art, creative lighting, and other safety measures.

B. HPC 2015-60: 523 Woodbine Avenue (Pulse USA, Inc.): Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition, demolish a one-story garage and construct a one-story garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)
Property owners Esa and Katie and architect Richard Schmidt were present

Planner Kaarre introduced the application. The house at 523 Woodbine Avenue is listed as a Contributing Resource within the Historic District. The stucco Foursquare was designed in 1919 by architect William Harlev, Jr for the Annie Johnson, and constructed by the Johnson Brothers. The scope of work meets the definition of demolition in the preservation ordinance, and therefore the project will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The proposal involves constructing a rear two-story stucco addition which is set back on the south façade and steps out on the north façade. The entire house is being rehabbed, and they propose to replace the original wood windows with vinyl and add wood railings to the front porch. Also, the existing non-contributing garage is proposed to be demolished and a new two-car garage with fiber cement stucco boards constructed.

The proposed addition was reviewed by the Architectural Review Committee, who recommended lining up the north bump-out with the rear corner of the house. That revision to the north elevation was made. The garage is set back on the south elevation, and its design and materials meet the Guidelines. The non-historic railings on the front porch will be replaced with wood railings. The existing garage is non-contributing, and will be replaced by a new garage clad in fiber cement boards to appear as stucco. It will be generally in the same location, but moved back several feet. The existing wood windows will be replaced with aluminum-clad wood windows to match the existing appearance. All work appears to meet the Architectural Review Guidelines. Therefore, Staff is recommending approval of the COA as submitted.

Rick Schmidt, Schmidt Design, reviewed the proposal and discussed the site plan.

November 12, 2015 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Motion by Battoglia to open the application for discussion. Second by McLean.

Mr. Schmidt noted that the replacement windows will be aluminum-clad wood windows to match the existing wood windows.

Motion by Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 523 Woodbine Avenue as submitted based on plans dated November 5 and 8, 2015 prepared by Schmidt Design, Inc. Second by Battoglia. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

C. HPC 2015-63: 800 N. East Avenue (Showalter): Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a one-story garage and construct a two-story garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)

Property owners Brent and Jill Showalter and contractor Brett Williams were present

Planner Kaarre introduced the application. The house at 800 N. East is listed as a Contributing Resource within the Historic District. The two-story stucco house was designed in 1912 for D. F. Beach, and was constructed by O. S. West. The 1-story stucco garage was constructed in 1919. The scope of work meets the definition of demolition in the preservation ordinance, and therefore the project will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The proposal involves demolishing a 1-story stucco garage and constructing a 2-story stucco garage with wood trim, vinyl windows and asphalt shingle roof. The house sits on a corner lot and the garage is visible from the street.

The applicants met with the Architectural Review Committee on October 28. The Committee recommended looking at ways to lower the scale of the garage. They also asked that the applicants make a stronger case for allowing the demolition of the existing garage. The revised plans involved lowering the height of the south half of the roof closest to the street. The condition of the existing garage appears to be significant, with leaning and bowed walls. Revisions to the proposed garage design as recommended by the Architectural Review Committee help to reduce the scale of the garage as viewed from Thomas Street. The design and use of stucco and wood materials make it compatible with the house. It will be in the same location, though larger. The windows will be 3-over-1 double-hung windows to match those in the house.

All work appears to meet the Architectural Review Guidelines. Staff is recommending approval of the COA as submitted, pending sufficient documentation that the condition of the existing garage makes repair and retention not feasible.

Brett Williams, Element Worx, presented the application. He discussed the massing, design, the context of the new garage, and the changes they have made to the design based on comments from the Architectural Review Committee.

Motion by Nally to open the application for discussion. Second by Palese.

The Commission discussed the size of the new garage in relation to other nearby garages. They also discussed the massing, scale and design in relation to the house and the street. They noted that the application meets the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Motion by Battoglia to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 800 N. East Avenue as submitted based on plans prepared by Element Worx. Second by McLean. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

D. **HPC 2015-67: 317 N. Kenilworth Avenue (Povilaitis): Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a mudroom and construct a new side mudroom addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**

Property owner Darius Povilaitis and architect William Scholtens were present

Planner Kaarre introduced the application. The house at 317 N. Kenilworth is an Oak Park Historic Landmark. The *William A. Douglass House* was designed in 1893 by Patton & Fisher. It is unclear when the mudroom and bay windows were constructed; it may have been in 1903 or 1908, when building permits were received for house alterations. As the property is a Historic Landmark, and the work will be visible from the street, the project will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The proposal involves demolishing the side mudroom, which is centered between two bay windows, and constructing a slightly larger mudroom and extending the front bay window back to connect with the mudroom. The materials will match those on the house, and the design is compatible with the Queen Anne architecture. The entrance to the mudroom will move from the front to the rear, to better serve use of the rear yard. The existing mudroom and bay windows are only visible from Kenilworth when looking southwest at an angle. The mudroom is minimally visible from the front, and the bay windows not at all. The proposed new mudroom and bay window extension will be clad with wood clapboard and slate shingle roof. The scale, massing, material and character are compatible with the house, and the historic character of the house will not be compromised. The flat-and-slate hip roof is compatible, yet makes a visual distinction as a new addition. All work appears to meet the Architectural Review Guidelines. Staff is recommending approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted.

Motion by Sokol to open the application for discussion. Second by Palese.

William Scholtens, Elements Architectural Group, discussed the design elements and noted that the existing mudroom is not likely to be original as it is attached to a rear, 20th-century addition. The Commission noted that the design solution is compatible but does not replicate existing materials and meets the Architectural Review Guidelines. They noted that alternative materials should be in scale with the structure.

Motion by Payne to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 317 N. Kenilworth Avenue as submitted based on plans prepared by William Scholtens, Elements Architectural Group, and received on November 4, 2015. Second by McLean. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Battaglia, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

CONSENT AGENDA

No business

OTHER BUSINESS

Drechsler Building Lift: Planner Kaarre noted that the pieces of the original 1898 lift were removed from the building at 1112 Lake Street in 2004 and have been stored in the basement of 129 Lake Street. Staff is seeking direction on what to do with the remains. The Historical Society cannot find a use for the materials and the Village has nowhere to store them. The Commission agreed that the lift pieces are a remnant of the building, are too difficult to display and have no real meaning outside of the structure. It was suggested that the Village consider donating the materials to a salvage company.

Motion by Sokol to recommend that the Village not to be bound to the 2004 Redevelopment Agreement in regards to preserving the remains of the Lift. Second by Payne. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Battaglia, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath

November 12, 2015 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Staff Approvals: October 2015 Staff permit approval report

ADJOURN

Motion by Sokol to adjourn. Second by McLean. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sokol, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 9:25 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner.