

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
July 9, 2015 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Room 102, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Joerg Albrecht, Greg Battoglia, Fred Brandstrader, Don McLean, Dan Moroney, Regina Nally Vice Chair Gary Palese
ABSENT: Chris Payne, Tony Quinn, Tom Sundling
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP, Urban Planner

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Albrecht to approve the meeting agenda. Second by Brandstrader. Motion approved 8-0.
AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Chair McGrath
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Albrecht to approve the May 14, 2015 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Moroney. Motion approved 8-0.
AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Chair McGrath
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. HPC 2015-34: 302 S. Humphrey Avenue (Binotti) – Certificate of Appropriateness to construct north and south-facing dormers on the main roof and a rear two-story addition (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)**
Architect Kim Smith was present representing the property owners.

Planner Kaarre provided the staff report. The two-story frame and stucco house is listed as a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The American Foursquare house was constructed in 1907 by J. H. Stephens. The proposal to add four dormers and a rear addition meets the definition of demolition in the preservation ordinance, and therefore the project will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The rear second-floor addition will be constructed over an existing one-story addition, and will be clad in stucco to match the house. A two-story addition will extend out from there. The design, location and materials are compatible with the house. Only the south façade will be visible from the street. Although setbacks are encouraged to help differentiate old from new, constructing over an existing structure makes that difficult to achieve. The four dormers – two on the north and two on the south – are designed to match the existing front dormer, and do not exceed half of the roof area visible from the street. Staff opinion is that the proposed dormers and rear addition appear to meet the Architectural Review Guidelines and is recommending approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application as submitted in plans prepared by Smith Architecture and dated April 3, 2015 (received June 30, 2015).

Kim Smith stated that as an architect and historic district resident, she thanks the Commission for everything they do.

Motion by Albrecht to open the application for discussion. Second by Palese.

July 9, 2015 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Commissioner Palese noted that the dormer additions, specifically on the south, would alter the character of the house due to their size and height.

Commissioner Albrecht stated that the appearance from the front remains the same and the additions will not change the character of the house.

Commissioner Nally agreed that the south dormers will be less visible due to the roof slope and the chimney, and won't alter the character of the house.

Chair McGrath noted that the two south dormers are technically one dormer designed to appear as two with a connecting "notch." She suggested looking at creating a deeper notch between the two south dormers, to further enhance their appearance as two separate dormers.

Commissioner Battoglia noted that the dormers and rear addition match the character of the house and meet the Guidelines.

Motion by Battoglia to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the dormers and rear addition at 302 S. Humphrey Avenue as submitted by Smith Architecture and dated April 3, 2015 (received June 30, 2015) with the condition that they look at a further setback of the notch between dormers on the south elevation. Second by Brandstrader. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

B. Hulbert Houses Historic District – Continue discussion of public process for proposed historic district designation

Chair McGrath provided an overview of the discussion from the June 22 meeting where they discussed the responses heard at the public meetings and how to move forward. Throughout all of the diverse opinions there was one common note to poll the property owners. The Commission then discussed the format for seeking property owner feedback.

Planner Kaarre noted that Village staff discussed various methods for seeking property owner feedback, and felt that to receive the best response they would prepare a postcard with questions and pre-paid postage that could then be dropped in the mail to return to the Village. The postcard would be mailed with a cover letter and Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ).

The Commission members had the following comments on the process:

- The FAQ should concentrate on answering those questions heard most often from property owners in straight-forward, easy to understand language.
- The HPC has no authority to solicit a vote of the property owners, but should only be making a recommendation to the Village Board on whether the neighborhood meets the criteria for historic district designation.
- The survey of property owners is not an official vote on the district, but is simply a way to solicit information to assist the Commission in gauging interest.

July 9, 2015 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

- The survey questions should be reduced in number and ask if owners support or do not support a National Register historic district and/or a local historic district.
- The survey format and types of question were discussed.
- The opinions of the property owners are valued by the Commission.

Property owner Todd Hauptmann (833 block S. Kenilworth), suggested splitting the National Register and Local historic district questions in two as they do not necessarily have to go together.

Pam and Ken Wiese (815 block S. Kenilworth) suggested taking care in how the the survey questions are worded and provided their opinions on whether the Hulbert Subdivision was worthy of historic district recognition.

Property owners Neal Buer and Lynn Hemberger, (834 S. Kenilworth), thanked the commission for including the property owner's opinions in their decision and noted that they just want to vote yes or no and not answer other survey questions.

The Commission will provide comments to Village staff on the survey questions and look to send out the mailer within a month.

CONSENT AGENDA

OTHER BUSINESS

2014 Certified Local Government Annual Report: The 2014 annual report was submitted to the Illinois Historic Preservation Agency as a requirement to maintain the Village's Certified Local Government (CLG) status. The CLG program provides a mechanism for local government participation in Federal historic preservation programs and provides opportunities to apply for grant funds. Oak Park has been a CLG since 1994.

Staff Approvals: May and June 2015 Staff permit approval report

ADJOURN

Motion by Albrecht to adjourn. Second by Brandstrader. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner.