

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
November 13, 2014 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Room 101, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Vice Chair Gary Palese, Joerg Albrecht, Greg Battoglia, Fred Brandstrader, Dan Moroney, Regina Nally, Chris Payne, Tony Quinn, Tom Sundling
ABSENT: Don McLean
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Albrecht to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by Palese. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Albrecht to approve the October 9, 2014 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Palese. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. HPC 2014-36: 1013 Superior Street (Wood): Public Hearing for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct three roof additions [under construction] (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**

Chair McGrath noted that the public hearing was continued from the October 9, 2014 meeting, and provided an overview of the process.

Motion by Sundling to approve the Findings of Fact for the Certificate of Appropriateness at 1013 Superior Street as submitted. Second by Palese. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Motion by Sundling to approve a Resolution for the Certificate of Appropriateness at 1013 Superior Street as submitted. Second by Palese. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Chair McGrath closed the public hearing.

- B. Historic Landmark: Public Hearing for the following:**
1010 Fair Oaks Avenue, I.M. Fixman House, Donald F. Gibbs/Schurecht Development, 1953

Chair McGrath opened the public hearing and noted that owner consent is on file with the Village.

Mr. Kaarre read the list of exhibits.

November 13, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Motion by Sundling to accept the nomination report for 1010 Fair Oaks Avenue as the Findings of Fact under criteria (1), (3) and (5). Second by Palese.

Commissioner Sundling applauded the owners for nominating this unique property. The nomination report was very interesting.

Bill McDonald, who authored the nomination report for the house's inclusion in the Pleasant Home Foundation's Shockingly Modern House Tour, discussed how it was difficult to verify who actually designed the home, and that the Fixmans were likely the driving force on its design.

There was no public comment in support or against the nomination.

The Commission discussed the nomination report and noted their support of the designation.

Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Motion by Albrecht to forward a Resolution and the Findings of Fact for 1010 Fair Oaks Avenue to the Village Board of Trustees for approval. Second by Palese. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Chair McGrath noted that the new procedures for discussing Certificates of Appropriateness and making motions will be in effect.

- C. **HPC 14-67: 527 Belleforte Avenue (Drezek)** – Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the second floor and rebuild to match existing with new siding, windows, front porch and rear addition (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

Property owner Kamil Drezek and architects Laszlo Simovic and Michael Cassil were present.

Mr. Kaarre provided an overview of the application, which includes the demolition and rebuilding of the second floor, dormer and front porch. Staff opinion is that the proposal meets the Guidelines, and is recommending approval as submitted.

Mr. Laszlo provided an overview of the application, and noted that they are adding to their request the removal of a cinderblock chimney.

Motion by Albrecht to discuss the Certificate of Appropriateness for 527 Belleforte Avenue. Second by Palese. Motion approved 9-0.

The Commission discussed the application and noted that the proposal follows the recommendations of the Architectural Review Committee. It is unclear what original features may remain, and the rebuilding of the second floor to match the existing form and massing, as well as the alteration of side window openings, meets the Guidelines.

Motion by Sundling that having reviewed the project and plans, the rebuilding of the second floor, cladding of the house, replacement of windows, and rear second floor addition meets the intention of the Guidelines and he recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 527 Belleforte Avenue with the addition of the chimney removal and addition of trim board on the

November 13, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

first floor subject to revised drawings being submitted to Staff. Second by Moroney. Motion approved 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Commissioner Brandstrader arrived.

- D. HPC 14-69: 1013 Superior Street (Wood)** – Request from property owner for the reclassification of the property from Contributing to Non-Contributing Resource within the historic district (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)
Property owner Dr. Antony Wood was present.

Dr. Wood reviewed his request and presented information on the definition of Non-Contributing Resource, neighboring house types and price ranges. He argued that the house does not contribute as a historic resource within the historic district based on aesthetics, size, prominence and visual impact. The house is not a Historic Landmark and should not be measured under the same requirements. He does not know what the house looked like prior to 1973. The house currently has aluminum siding, replacement windows and roof, new garage and replacement porch.

Motion by Albrecht to discuss the Request for change in Contributing Status for 1013 Superior Street. Second by Palese. Motion approved 9-0.

The Commission discussed the proposal and request. The main argument is that the character of the house is changed enough that it should not have been listed as a Contributing Resource. Mr. Kaarre noted that the Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District encompasses approximately 2000 buildings, of which approximately 200 are Non-Contributing.

The Commission discussed the merit of approving the change, as well as whether it would set a precedent for other properties. Mr. Kaarre noted that at least four properties in the last 12 years have been changed to Non-Contributing status based on factors including alterations, condition and site integrity. Each case was reviewed based on its individual merits.

There was a statement of support for the applicant's conclusion by some, and that alterations to the house that have already been made should be considered. The errors in the review process both by the applicant and by the Village should also be considered. Each case has its own issues and merit. The removal and change in character of the roof is a major factor in supporting the change in status.

Alternately, there was also concern by some that the change in status would set a precedent for other owners to make the same request. Once a property has been determined to be a Non-Contributing Resource, it can be altered or demolished without review or approval by the Commission. Some felt the recent changes to the house do not meet the Guidelines. Those opposed to the change in status noted that the district includes a wide variety of building types, styles and ages that contribute to the district's character, and the fact that the house is not a Historic Landmark should not be a factor.

Motion by Brandstrader to reclassify the property at 1013 Superior Street as a Non-Contributing Resource within the Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District based on the information provided by the applicant received on November 6, 2014, and in consideration of the prior removal of the roof elements which were defined by expert witness Timothy N. Wittman as the major character-defining features of the property. Second by Moroney. Motion approved 6-4.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Moroney, Nally, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: Battaglia, Palese, Payne, Quinn

- E. **HPC 14-70: 745 Forest Avenue (Letchos)** – Certificate of Appropriateness to replace 24 decorative wood windows with vinyl windows (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)
Property owner Peggy Letchos was present.

Mr. Kaarre provided an overview of the application, which includes the replacement of all the original wood decorative windows with vinyl replacement windows. Staff opinion is that the proposal does not meet the Guidelines, and is not recommending approval.

Ms. Letchos noted that the windows are in very bad condition with layers of paint and rot. They are also inefficient. A good quality vinyl replacement window seems the best solution. The grille pattern will be similar but not matching. The existing pattern is too busy and the proposal is a cleaner look.

Motion by Brandstrader to discuss the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 745 Forest Avenue. Second by Sundling. Motion approved 10-0.

The Commission discussed the application. The existing wood decorative windows are unique, significant and are a defining characteristic of the house. The Guidelines state that the windows should be retained and repaired. Repair is a feasible and affordable option. If the Commission were to approve replacement, the replacement windows must match the existing pattern, and may be either wood or clad-wood windows. Vinyl is not an acceptable material. Capping the trim is also not acceptable, and should be painted. In addition, the majority of the windows are visible from the street, as the house sits on a corner lot. The Commission provided an overview of the Window Policy within the Architectural Review Guidelines. It was noted that the cost of the window repair would qualify towards the Property Tax Assessment Freeze program for historic houses.

There was no motion for approval, and the Commission took no action on the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 745 Forest Avenue.

Mr. Kaarre noted the options for the applicant moving forward.

CONSENT AGENDA

OTHER BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness Applications: The Commission reviewed the revisions to the COA application, including a list of submittal requirements, and approved of those changes.

Architectural Review Committee: Update on October 22, 2014 meeting, including preliminary review of 527 Belleforte Avenue and discussion of changes to the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Staff Approvals: October 2014 Staff permit approval report

Historic Preservation Awards: Commissioner Payne volunteered to present the awards at the November 20 event to be held at the Nineteenth Century Club.

ADJOURN

Motion by Brandstrader to adjourn. Second by Sundling. Motion approved 10-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Moroney, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 9:50 p.m.