

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
July 10, 2014 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Joerg Albrecht, Fred Brandstrader, Dan Moroney, Gary Palese, Chris Payne, Tony Quinn, Tom Sundling
ABSENT: Greg Battaglia, Don McLean, Regina Nally,
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP – Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Albrecht to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by Sundling. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Moroney, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Albrecht to approve the June 12, 2014 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Brandstrader. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Moroney, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. HPC 2014-38: 11 Elizabeth Court (Mickus): Certificate of Advisory Review to construct a one-story addition and garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**
Chris Mickus, property owner, and Mark Filoramo, architect, were present

Chair McGrath provided an explanation of the process. The property is listed as Non-Contributing, therefore the Commission's comments are Advisory.

Staff introduced the application. The house at 11 Elizabeth Court is a Non-Contributing Resource within the *Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*. The Colonial Revival (Cape Cod) style house was designed by architect R. J. McClaren and constructed by R. Houston, Jr. & Sons in 1947. The period of significance for the historic district ends in 1941. The brick cottage is connected to the one-story garage by a small one-story enclosed breezeway; both the breezeway and garage are clad in wood siding with a 6-8 inch reveal. The house sits at the northwest corner of Elizabeth Court and N. Kenilworth Avenue. The proposal is to demolish the mudroom breezeway and garage and construct a one-story addition and detached one-story two-car garage to the west of the existing house. The addition and garage will be modern in style, with horizontal fiber cement board siding and flat roof. The garage will face Elizabeth in a similar layout to the existing garage though the addition and garage will encompass a larger footprint. As the property is a Non-Contributing Resource, this review falls under the Advisory Review procedures.

The applicant Chris Mickus and architect Mark Filoramo met with the Architectural Review Committee on June 23. The Committee expressed concerns regarding the relationship of the design of the addition to the house, and its relationship to the site and the context of the neighborhood, and requested additional information, including schematic perspective drawings. These have been submitted.

July 10, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Mr. Mickus noted that they want a Modern addition on their house. They feel it is a great location and their architect shares their creative aesthetic vision. They have thought about the impact on the historic district and did incorporate some of the Architectural Review Committee's recommended changes, including the addition of a garden wall and some window changes.

The Commission discussed the proposal with the applicant and his architect. The cladding on the addition is fiber cement panels. The addition and garage will have a larger footprint than the existing garage. The applicants plan on meeting with the neighbors. They discussed the context with the neighborhood and the relationship between the addition and the house. It was noted that it may look out of place in the neighborhood context. There is a sharp contrast between house and addition, but the materials will help bring them together. Several commissioners appreciated the Modern design of the proposed addition. They discussed roof form, massing, and siting. They discussed whether to retain or replace the original front door, as it will no longer be used, rather than having two entrances. They discussed its prominent location on Kenilworth. They will clean and repaint the house, and the house and addition will be in the same color palette. They are looking for ways to be compatible. They looked at alternative designs such as flat roof versus sloped roof. They don't need the additional volume from a sloped roof. They prefer the contrast of the flat roof with a smaller impact.

It was noted that the Applicants made some design revisions based on the comments received from the Architectural Review Committee. The window sizes in the addition were adjusted, the windows were aligned with those in the original structure and a low wall was added that defined a garden off of the south side of the original structure. The Commission also noted that a well-designed modern addition is an acceptable method of adding on to a historic structure. However they also noted the prominence of the site and the character of the surrounding buildings and suggested the applicants carefully consider all aspects of the design including scale, form, massing and material choices in order to be as compatible as possible.

The Commission questioned both the quality level of the materials on the addition as well as the compatibility of the new materials to those on the existing structure. They suggested the use of natural materials and suggested either matching materials between house and addition or at least using materials of the same quality and visual scale. The size, placement and prominence of the garage form was questioned. It was suggested that the garage size and placement be studied.

B. 2015 HPC Work Plan: Discussion of proposed work plan and budget

Staff provided an overview of the draft work plan. The Commission discussed the merits of conducting a Multiple Property Nomination in south Oak Park (Madison to Roosevelt), and north Oak Park (Division to North), as well the merits of looking at potential historic districts on Harrison Street and elsewhere in south Oak Park. They recommended asking the State to look at the Harrison Arts District's eligibility for listing in the National Register. They agreed to include investigating a Hulbert Historic District as it is a significant area and well-qualified, as well as already recognized by the Illinois Historic Preservation Agency as eligible for listing in the National Register. They agreed to leave the Multiple Property Nomination on the work plan for now, including the budget request, and investigate the proposal further. Commissioner Moroney did not feel it was a useful way to spend money.

Motion by Albrecht to recommend approval of the 2015 HPC Work Plan as amended. Second by Palese. Motion approved 7-1.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: Moroney

CONSENT AGENDA

OTHER BUSINESS

Education Committee: Update on June 23, 2014 meeting

Architectural Review Committee: Update on June 25, 2014 meeting

Staff Approvals: Planner Kaarre provided a report on the 121 Staff permit approvals for June 2014.

ADJOURN

Motion by Palese to adjourn. Second by Albrecht. Motion approved: 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Moroney, Palese, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 9:20 p.m. Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre.

U:\Development Customer Services\Planning_HISTORIC PRESERVATION\HPC Agendas and Minutes\2014\2014 Minutes\2014-07-10-historic-preservation-commission-minutes.docx