

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
June 12, 2014 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Joerg Albrecht, Greg Battoglia, Don McLean, Dan Moroney, Chris Payne, Tony Quinn, Tom Sundling
ABSENT: Fred Brandstrader, Regina Nally, Gary Palese
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP – Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Sundling to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by Moroney. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Sundling to approve the May 8, 2014 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Albrecht. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. HPC 2014-30: Austin Gardens (Park District of Oak Park): Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District)**
Mike Grandy, Park District of Oak Park, and Carol Yetken, CYLA Design Associates, were present.

Staff introduced the application. The existing garage was constructed at some time between 1935-1947, though there are no permits on file. The main house was demolished in 1964; however, the garage was retained for use as storage. In 2005 the Park District approved a Site Master Plan for the park, which included plans to demolish the garage to allow for the construction of a new learning center and building for use by the Festival Theater. At the time neither the park nor the garage was located within a historic district. In 2009 the park was included within the boundary expansion of the *Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*. The local boundaries were expanded in 2012 to match. The property was listed as a Contributing Resource within the historic district, and its demolition therefore requires a Certificate of Appropriateness application and review and approval by the Historic Preservation Commission.

The period of significance for the *Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District* ends in 1941. The garage is a remnant of a former residential site and is not designed in any particular style, but is utilitarian in nature. Based on when the garage was constructed, it does not represent any significant link with the heritage of the site, nor does it contribute to the historic character of the park or historic district. Staff believes that it was originally listed as a Contributing Resource based solely on its age without consideration of these other factors. Staff opinion is that the structure is a Non-Contributing Resource within the historic district and recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to demolish the structure.

Carol Yetken, CYLA Design Associates, prepared the site master plan in 2005 and conducted research on the property. She and the Park District agree that the garage does not contribute to the character of the historic district and request its demolition.

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application to demolish the garage in Austin Gardens as submitted. Second by Battoglia.

The Commission discussed the possible date of the garage and agreed that it was a non-contributing resource within the historic district.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

- B. HPC 2014-26: 325 S. Euclid Avenue (Van Ermen):** Certificate of Appropriateness for dormer additions, skylights, dormer windows (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)
Architect Troy Pavelka, Normandy Architects, was present.

Staff introduced the application. The two-story frame house was constructed prior to 1902. The house is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*, and exterior work visible from the street requires Historic review. The scope of work meets the definition of demolition in the preservation ordinance, and therefore the project will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The proposal involves constructing rear additions to both gabled bays/dormers on the north and south facades, as well as replacing the multi-paned attic windows with Pella Architect series white aluminum-clad multi-paned windows, and adding four skylights – two on the north and two on the south-facing roof slopes. The HPC Architectural Review Committee requested several alternative designs for consideration. Staff is recommending approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the original dormer addition design as it is the least visible from the street; allow the replacement of the attic windows with the proposed Pella aluminum-clad ILT windows, and to allow the use of the skylights due to the code requirements as there does not seem to be a more compatible solution.

Troy Pavelka, Normandy Architects, provided an overview of the proposal. He submitted several alternative designs as requested by the HPC Architectural Review Committee.

Motion by Sundling to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 325 S. Euclid Avenue as submitted. Second by Moroney.

The Commission discussed the original submittal and the alternative design options. They determined that Alternative Option A (gable additions), replacement of the attic windows, and eliminating the skylights altogether would meet the Guidelines.

Amendment by Sundling to the Motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 325 S. Euclid Avenue to approve Alternative Option A (gable additions), replacement of the attic windows, and elimination of the skylights. Second of amended motion by Moroney.

Amended motion approved 7-1.

AYE: Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: Albrecht

- C. HPC 2014-29: 830 N. Oak Park Avenue (McHugh):** Certificate of Appropriateness for front porch rehab and side addition alterations, siding alterations and a rear two-story addition (*Frank Lloyd Wright/Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)
Property owner Paul McHugh and architect Errol Kirsch were present.

June 12, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Staff introduced the application. The two-story frame house (clad in aluminum siding) was constructed in 1922 by L. L. McNutt. The house is a Contributing Resource within the *Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*, and exterior work visible from the street requires Historic review. The scope of work meets the definition of demolition in the preservation ordinance, and therefore the project will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The proposed work replacing front stoop, side walls and columns to match existing; returning the first floor side porch to a screen porch; and constructing a rear two-story addition. The replacement of windows and installation of fiber cement board siding over the original siding falls under the Advisory Review process. Staff is recommending approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted as it meets the Guidelines.

Errol Kirsch, Errol J. Kirsch Architects, stated that they recently determined that the entire side porch will require demolition and they propose to rebuild it exactly as drawn in the submitted drawings.

The Commission discussed the application and determined that the project as amended with the demolition of the side porch to be reconstructed as proposed meets the Guidelines.

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 830 N. Oak Park Avenue to include demolition and rebuilding of side porch. Second by Battaglia.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, McLean, Moroney, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

D. **HPC 2014-35: 850 N. Elmwood Avenue (McHugh):** Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition, new porch, windows (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

Property owner Paul McHugh and architect Errol Kirsch were present.

Staff introduced the application. The two-story stucco house was constructed in 1920 by developer D. W. Frank, Jr. and designed by architect Adolph G. Burtar. It sits on the southeast corner of Elmwood Avenue and Division Street. Exterior work visible from the street requires Historic review. The proposal involves demolition and will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The applicants are proposing the following work:

- a) Construct a rear two-story addition that will be clad in stucco to match the house;
- b) Construct a new 2-car stucco garage with hip roof to be placed at the alley in the location of the existing garage;
- c) Move the main entrance of the home from the north side to the south side, retain the original entry porch and side wall, remove the door and installing windows, remove the stairs only. The new north entry porch will be open with stucco posts, side walls and hip roof similar to the existing north porch, but will be slightly larger;
- d) Remove two window openings on the north elevation facing Division Street and infill with stucco to match existing.
- e) Move the art glass window facing Division Street to the west several feet, due to interior kitchen layout.
- f) Remove 6 double-hung windows openings from the first floor and 4 basement windows all from the south elevation, 5 of those for the new entry porch and 5 for a new interior stair.
- g) Replace all other windows with 1-over-1 clad wood double-hung windows.

Staff is recommending approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application with the recommendation to add a window on the second floor of the west elevation facing Elmwood to avoid a blank wall facing the street.

June 12, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 850 N. Elmwood Avenue as submitted. Second by Payne.

The Commission the design of the addition, including roof and window placement, as well as the design of the new south porch.

Albrecht amended the motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 850 N. Elmwood Avenue to include the following conditions:

- *Remove the first floor roof element from the north elevation of the addition.*
- *Add a covered, hip-roofed porch on the rear of the addition similar to those elsewhere on the house.*
- *Provide additional windows on the north elevation of the addition that are vertically aligned and paired as is found elsewhere on the house.*
- *Provide a pair of windows on the west elevation of the addition on the second floor facing Elmwood Avenue, as if found elsewhere on the house.*
- *Consider eliminating or reducing the bermed walkway from Elmwood Avenue to the new front porch.*

Payne seconded the amended motion. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

- E. **HPC 2014-33: 304 Clinton Avenue (Mack Companies):** Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*)
Architects Ideal Custom Designs were present.

Staff introduced the application. The two-story frame house was constructed prior to 1895. It appears to have undergone several alterations, including the front gable and front porch. The house is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*, and exterior work visible from the street requires Historic review. The scope of work meets the definition of demolition in the preservation ordinance, and therefore the project will require a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The proposal involves the construction of rear two-story addition with a two-story wing extending into the south side yard, a two-story bay on the north façade, changes in eave depth and the use of composite siding as means to providing a visual distinction between the house and addition. The non-historic railing on the roof of the front porch will be removed. The historic wood siding on the front façade will be retained and restored. The siding on the sides has been replaced, and the proposal is to use a composite siding on the sides and addition to match the appearance of the existing. The windows will either be repaired or replaced in kind. The roof will be replaced as existing. Staff recommended approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application as submitted

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 304 Clinton Avenue as submitted. Second by Payne.

The Commission discussed the application and determined that the project as proposed meets the Guidelines.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

- F. **HPC 2014-34: 1146 Wenonah Avenue (Jarasek):** Certificate of Appropriateness to rebuild the front porch (*Gunderson Historic District*)
Property owners Mark and Nancy Jarasek and Steve Draths, Brighton Home Products, were present.

Staff introduced the application. The two-story frame house was constructed by the Pillinger Brothers in 1905 for S. T. Gunderson & Sons and is a Contributing Resource within the historic district. It sits on the northeast corner of Wenonah and Fillmore Avenues. Exterior work visible from the street requires Historic review. The proposal involves demolition and will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The applicants are proposing the following work:

- Replace the wood tongue-and-groove porch floor and wood stairs with AZEK tongue-and-groove flooring.
- Replace the front porch railings with Trex railings.
- Replace the paired wood Doric columns with HB&G square synthetic fiberglass posts (PermaLite Square Plain) in a set of three at each corner.

Staff is not recommending approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application based on the change from round columns to square posts, which alters the historic character of the house. New columns should be round and match the dimensions and appearance of the existing columns.

Motion by Battaglia to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 1146 Wenonah Avenue as submitted. Second by Sundling.

The Commission discussed the design and materials of the proposed replacement porch.

Albrecht amended the motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 850 N. Elmwood Avenue to include the following conditions:

- *Eliminate the center post from the porch railings, if possible.*
- *Replacement of the original wood columns with structural fiberglass columns was approved. The new columns must match the appearance of the existing columns.*
- *Replacement of the porch flooring and stairs with AZEK tongue and groove flooring was approved.*
- *Replacement of the wood railings with Trex railings was approved.*

Payne seconded the amended motion. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battaglia, McLean, Moroney, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

- G. **HPC 2014-36: 1013 Superior Street (Wood):** Certificate of Appropriateness to construct three roof additions [*under construction*] (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)
Property owner Antony Wood was present.

Staff introduced the application. The two-story frame house was constructed c. 1885 and is a Contributing Resource within the historic district. It faces north on Superior Street just west of Forest Avenue. Exterior work visible from the street requires Historic review. The proposal involves demolition and will require a Certificate of Appropriateness. A building permit application was submitted on May 5 with the following scope of work, "*Tear off existing roof including rafters, install new rafters and roof; tear off and reroof garage.*" Staff approved the application under Action 4 (no change in materials), based on the assumption per the scope of work that the roof was being rebuilt to match existing. The permit was issued on May 8.

Staff visited the site for a project follow-up on June 3 and determined that the scope of work which was under construction exceeded what was implied on the building permit application. The front

June 12, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

hip/gable combination had been extended to a full gable. The west-facing hip roof had been extended to a full gable. A shed dormer had been added to the west-facing roof slope. The Building and Property Standards Department issued a Stop Work Order on June 3. Staff spoke with the contractor on the phone on June 5 and met with contractor on June 5 and 6, explaining the Historic review process and requesting he submit a Certificate of Appropriateness application, elevations and a project narrative. The contractor submitted the information on June 6.

The proposal involves cladding the dormer and gable ends with vinyl in a scalloped shingle pattern. The house is clad with aluminum siding. The construction is nearly complete, with the new asphalt shingle roof having already been installed on the east-facing roof slope. The west and north roof slopes are clad only in tar paper. Authorization has been given to complete work on the garage.

It is Staff's opinion that the project would have originally required a COA and been forwarded to the HPC for approval, based on the visibility of the proposed changes from the street. The role of the Historic Preservation in the case of a project that is under construction is to determine if the work already completed meets the Roofing Policy of the Guidelines. The main issues would be changes to the original roof slope/configuration and addition of a shed dormer. Also, the garage was constructed in 1962 and is a Non-Contributing Resource.

Based on conversations with the contractor, the purpose of the project is to provide additional storage space in the attic. There are no building permits on file showing changes to the house, which indicates that the former roof configuration was likely original. The combination hip/gable roof on the front of the house appears to be a significant character-defining feature of this simple frame house, and Staff recommends the front be returned to its original configuration. The alteration of the side hip to a gable does not result in a significant change to the character of the house, and Staff recommends approval as submitted. The shed dormer does not technically meet the Guidelines as the roof slope does not match that of the house. However, shed dormers are commonly approved as compatible additions to gabled roof slopes, and there is precedent of HPC approval. Also, it meets the size requirement within the Guidelines and does not alter the character of the house.

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 1013 Superior Street as submitted. Second by McLean.

Mr. Wood presented on the proposed changes to the house and discussed the need for additional storage space. The dormer provides additional ceiling height where the stairs enter the attic. He noted that the proposed changes were in keeping with the character of the neighborhood.

The Commission discussed the project and found that the proposed work to the front of the house did not meet the Roofing Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines and would have an adverse effect on the historic character of the house, and took no action on the Certificate of Appropriateness application. The following are the relevant Guidelines reviewed by the Commission:

- *The original form and shape of the roof shall be retained.*
- *Changes to the roof slope are not acceptable, unless earlier, non-historic changes are being reversed.*

The Commission indicated that they were supportive of altering the west-facing hip roof, which is less visible from the street and does not alter the historic character of the house. They also noted that dormers are an acceptable method under the New Addition Policy of the Guidelines for adding space to an interior room. The Commission recommended changing the front gable back to its original hip/gable configuration as it is considered a character-defining feature of the house.

June 12, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

H. **2015 HPC Work Plan**: Discuss proposed 2015 HPC work plan and budget

The Commission referred discussion of the Work Plan to the HPC Education Committee meeting on June 23, 2014.

CONSENT AGENDA

I. **HPC 07-52: 644 Madison Street (Foley-Rice Cadillac)** – Preliminary determination of eligibility for Historic Landmark designation – request 180-day extension of consideration: Continued from December 12, 2013.

Motion by Sundling to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted. Second by Albrecht.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, McLean, Moroney, Payne, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

OTHER BUSINESS

HPC Liaison to Environment & Energy Commission: Chair McGrath asked for a volunteer to act as the liaison to the EEC. As there were no volunteers, the item was tabled until the next meeting.

HPC collaboration with the Plan Commission: Chair McGrath discussed working further with Staff and the Plan Commission on HPC review of commercial projects outside of historic districts.

Education Committee: Update on May 12, 2014 meeting

Architectural Review Committee: Update on May 28, 2014 meeting

Staff Approvals: Planner Kaarre provided a report on the 115 Staff permit approvals for May 2014.

ADJOURN

Motion by Palese to adjourn. Second by Battoglia. Motion approved: 9-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Brandstrader, McLean, Nally, Palese, Payne, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 11:30 p.m. Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre.

U:\CPD_Strategic\Community Planning\HISTORIC PRESERVATION\HPC Agendas and Minutes\2014\2014 Minutes\2014-06-12-historic-preservation-commission-minutes.docx