

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
February 13, 2014 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Rosanne McGrath, Joerg Albrecht, Fred Brandstrader, Garret Eakin, Frank Heitzman, Regina Nally, Tony Quinn, Tom Sundling
ABSENT: Greg Battoglia, Drew Niermann, Gary Palese
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, AICP – Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Albrecht to approve the meeting agenda as submitted. Second by Eakin. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

MINUTES

Motion by Albrecht to approve the December 12, 2013 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Eakin. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

A. Tammie Grossman, Development Customer Services Department Director

Tammie Grossman introduced herself. She was recently appointed as the new director of the Development Customer Services Department, which includes Planning, Historic Preservation, CDBG, Housing, Business Services, and Building and Property Standards. She wanted to meet the Historic Preservation Commission and invite anyone to contact her with questions or comments.

B. HPC 13-40: 134 S. Taylor Avenue (Chris Goode): Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear second floor addition, enlarge the side entry porch, and remove the clay tile roof (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)

Property owners Pete Byer and Deepa Gupta and architect Chris Goode of Architecture & Conservation were present.

Planner Kaarre presented the Staff Report. The building is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The one and one-half story stucco Bungalow was constructed in 1921 by Benson and Peterson for owner Robert Houston, and designed by architect Ernest N. Braucher. The proposal involves removing the green Spanish clay tile roof from the house, widening the side entry porch to the south and constructing a new hip roof, constructing a second floor addition with front-facing gable on the rear half of the house clad in stucco to match existing, and installing a green asphalt shingle roof over the entire house and addition. They submitted roof repair and replacement estimates.

The Historic Preservation Commission reviewed the application at its December 12, 2013 meeting and recommended that the applicants and their architect consider alternative designs for the addition and porch, and requested additional estimates on the clay tile roof repair. The Architectural

February 12, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Review Committee reviewed six alternative designs on January 8, 2014 and recommending further investigation into two, which incorporated a lower gable-front roof and shed dormers, and a lower hip porch roof. The applicants and their architect investigated numerous design alternatives which sought to meet the Architectural Review Guidelines while satisfying their interior space needs. They have proposed a design similar to the original gable front design in terms of appearance, materials and height, which has lowered the porch roof to a hip, and replaces the tile roof with asphalt.

Chris Goode, project architect, stated that they have not given up on saving the clay tile roof, but are waiting to receive additional bids from contractors. They looked at numerous design alternatives for the addition, and dismissed most of them for various reasons. The proposed height is only 8 feet taller than the original roof line.

Motion by Albrecht to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 134 S. Taylor Avenue as submitted based on plans by Christopher Goode, Architecture & Conservation, dated February 5, 2014 and on the use of Grand Manor Certainteed roofing shingles. Second by Sundling.

The Commission noted that the simplified porch roof and other modifications to project are a big improvement. The addition is sympathetic to the character of the house and will remain much smaller in scale than adjoining houses. They noted that skylights visible from the street are discouraged by the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

C. HPC 14-04: 220 S. Scoville Avenue (Libunao) – Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear one-story addition and new front porch (Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District)

Architect Mark Zinni of Mark Zinni Architects was present.

Planner Kaarre presented the Staff Report. The house is a Contributing Resource in the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The two-story house was constructed in 1903 by the Ira C. Saxe & Son for George W. Woodbury. The proposal is to construct a rear one-story addition and re-open the enclosed front porch.

Motion by Brandstrader to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 220 S. Scoville Avenue as submitted based on plans by Mark Zinni Architects, Ltd., dated February 3, 2014. Second by Quinn.

The Commission discussed the siding and foundation materials on the addition, the porch columns and railings.

Motion by Brandstrader to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 220 S. Scoville Avenue as submitted based on plans by Mark Zinni Architects, Ltd., dated February 3, 2014 was amended to include the following conditions:

- *Match the appearance, height and materials of the foundation on the rear one-story addition to the foundation on the house.*
- *Add a post in the center of the front porch railings to match the design on the roof balustrade of the addition.*

Amendment seconded by Quinn. Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

D. HPC 14-05: 305 N. East Avenue (Borel) – Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

Architect Keith Jones, Studio Integra, was present.

Planner Kaarre presented the Staff Report. The two-story stucco house was constructed in 1911 by the Andrews Brothers for Mrs. J. K. Hanna. The house is a Contributing Resource within the *Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*. The proposal involves constructing a rear two-story addition in the same configuration as the existing addition but with additional length. The materials and appearance will match the existing house.

Keith Jones, project architect, noted that the existing addition will be completely demolished for the new addition.

Motion by Sundling to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 305 N. East Avenue as submitted based on plans and elevations by Keith Jones, Studio Integra, dated January 24 and February 5, 2014. Second by Albrecht.

Motion approved 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

E. HPC 14-06: 711 Belleforte Avenue (Baronger Group) – Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear two-story addition and new front porch (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*)

Property owner Mitch Goldstein, Baronger Group, was present.

Planner Kaarre presented the Staff Report. The two-story frame gable front house was constructed ca. 1900 and is a Contributing Resource within the *Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*. The proposal involves constructing a rear two-story addition, replacing existing windows with aluminum-clad wood windows, removing the asphalt siding and repairing the original wood siding and re-opening the enclosed front porch.

Motion by Eakin to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 711 Belleforte Avenue as submitted. Second by Nally.

The Commission noted that the elevations were out of proportion with the original house. Mr. Goldstein noted that the roof was to be raised. The Commission discussed the windows, front porch stairs and roof changes.

The Commission took no action on the application and asked for the following additional information:

- Move the front porch stairs to align with the front door on the house.
- Revise the elevations to accurately reflect the proportions and height of the house.
- Confirm the materials of the existing windows and submit photographs.
- Provide a written justification for changes to the height of the roof based on the Architectural Review Guidelines (see attached).

OTHER BUSINESS

Village Hall National Register Nomination: Planner Kaarre noted that the review of the nomination by the Illinois Historic Sites Advisory Committee has been delayed until June 2014.

February 12, 2014 Minutes of the Historic Preservation Commission

Hogans Home and Harvey Subdivision National Register Nominations: Planner Kaarre noted that a preliminary determination of eligibility for the National Register has been delayed by the Illinois Historic Preservation Agency until they can make a site visit to view the subdivisions – likely in March.

Staff Approvals: Planner Kaarre provided a report on the 42 Staff permit approvals for January 2014.

ADJOURN

Motion by Sundling to adjourn. Second by Eakin. Motion approved: 8-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Brandstrader, Eakin, Heitzman, Nally, Quinn, Sundling, Chair McGrath

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 9:15 p.m. Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre.

U:\CPD_Strategic\Community Planning\HISTORIC PRESERVATION\HPC Agendas and Minutes\2014\2014 Minutes\2014-02-13-historic-preservation-commission-minutes.docx