

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
July 11, 2013 Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Room 101, 7:30 pm

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Chair Christina Morris, Joerg Albrecht, Greg Battoglia, Garret Eakin, Frank Heitzman, Rosanne McGrath, Regina Nally, Gary Palese, Tony Quinn, Tom Sundling
ABSENT: Drew Niermann
STAFF: Douglas Kaarre, Urban Planner/Historic Preservation

AGENDA APPROVAL

Motion by Eakin to approve the Agenda as submitted. Second by Battoglia.
Motion approved 6-0.
AYE: Battoglia, Eakin, McGrath, Palese, Quinn, Chair Morris
NAY: None

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None

Commissioners Albrecht and Sundling arrived.

MINUTES

Motion by McGrath to approve the June 13, 2013 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Quinn.
Motion approved 8-0.
AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, McGrath, Palese, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris
NAY: None

Commissioner Heitzman arrived.

Motion by Sundling to approve the June 24, 2013 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by Heitzman. Motion approved 9-0.
AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Heitzman, McGrath, Palese, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris
NAY: None

Motion by Eakin to approve the June 26, 2013 meeting minutes as submitted. Second by McGrath.
Motion approved 9-0.
AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Heitzman, McGrath, Palese, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris
NAY: None

REGULAR AGENDA

- A. **HPC 13-16: 221 S. Harvey Avenue (Oak Homes Corporation)** – Certificate of Appropriateness for a second floor addition (*Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*) continued from the June 13, 2013 meeting

Planner Kaarre presented the Staff Report. The 1-1/2 story frame cottage was constructed in 1909. The small gabled dormer on the north elevation was constructed in 1958 and the rear one-story frame addition was constructed in 1967. The building is a Contributing Resource within the *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*. The proposal is to construct a second-floor gable-front addition on the rear half of the house to be clad in 4" fiber cement board siding and shingles in the gable end; and construct a second floor side gable addition above the rear/side one-story wing to be clad

in 4" fiber cement board siding. The HPC reviewed the application at its June 13, 2013 meeting and recommended revisions to meet the Guidelines. The HPC Architectural Review Committee met on June 26 to review three options submitted by the applicant. The committee recommended that Option 1, which retained the front-facing gable and lowered the ridgeline by 2 feet, was the option that was the most compatible with the house. They also discussed the proposed changes to the front porch, and suggested not adding a third, center column if not required, and agreed that the existing railings were historic, though not likely original, and that they should be retained and repaired as they are part of the character of the house. Retaining and repairing the historic porch railings would meet the Guidelines.

The proposed rear two-story/second floor addition to the house will alter the overall appearance of the house, but will not detrimentally affect the historic character, as the original front 17 feet of the house will remain intact. Although the rear two-story/second floor addition is taller than the existing ridge-line, it is set well back from the front and has been lowered 2 feet from the original submittal. The side-facing gable also allows the roof to slope back away from the front of the house, assisting in reducing the scale of the addition. Due to the significant setback from the front of the house (approximately 17 feet), it will not alter the character of the streetscape. The existing house to the south at 225 S. Harvey is a large 2-story American Foursquare with hipped roof, which will remain slightly taller or the same as the proposed addition. The house to the north at 217 S. Harvey is also a large 2-story gable front Victorian, and will remain slightly taller or the same as the proposed addition. Again, the significant setback of the addition from the front will not impact the streetscape. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application as submitted.

Motion by Heitzman to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application for 221 S. Harvey Avenue as revised. Second by Eakin.

Planner Kaarre noted that the existing porch railing was already removed prior to discussion by the HPC Architectural Review Committee.

Commissioner Sundling noted that to reconstruct the porch railing with its wide spacing may not meet the building code.

Commissioner Heitzman stated that the code was revised for historic porches.

Marek Salamon, project architect, stated that they are open to reconstructing the existing railing or building the railing originally proposed. They also think there was originally a middle column on the porch as there is a pier underneath.

Commissioner Eakin stated that they should not add the middle column if its not necessary. This is a great project that has been carefully thought out. The perspective drawing was very helpful.

Commissioner Heitzman suggested removing the trim from underneath the roofing in the eave.

Commissioner Palese noted that this addition will be visible from both sides and takes away from the historic character of the house.

Commissioner Eakin noted that house must adapt to survive.

Planner Kaarre provided examples of second floor additions previously approved by the HPC.

Commissioner Heitzman stated that the porch railing should not have been removed prior to HPC approval and issuance of a building permit.

Commissioner Battoglia asked if adding a second floor addition would change the status to Non-Contributing. Many bungalows with second floor additions in the I-290 Survey were labeled as Non-Contributing.

Planner Kaarre noted that many of those were amended during the review process. Typically if the HPC is approving the project, then that means you believe it meets the Guidelines, and so it would remain a Contributing Resource.

Commissioner Palese stated that it changes the character too much. It's no longer a bungalow.

Motion approved 8-1.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Heitzman, McGrath, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris

NAY: Palese

OTHER BUSINESS

Staff Approvals: Planner Kaarre provided a report on the 156 Staff permit reviews for June 2013.

The Commission discussed floor additions on Bungalows and how they impact integrity and status as Contributing Resources. Planner Kaarre noted that the Guidelines are subject to interpretation and each project is subject to individual situations. Chair Morris stated that Contributing status is interpreted differently everywhere. Commissioner McGrath stated that some of the potential historic districts contain much smaller homes and they need to be careful how Contributing status is defined there. Planner Kaarre stated that when a district is nominated its important characteristics are defined which determines Contributing status. Chair Morris stated that continued use of the RuskinArc software has been approved and they will plan to reach out to property owners in the potential districts. Commissioner Sundling asked about the validity of conducting a survey in reaction to the potential expressway expansion. Planner Kaarre stated that the timing of the survey was a reaction, but conducting a survey and identifying historic resources is an important planning tool. Surveys are often conducted when there is a perceived threat.

Village Hall National Register Nomination: Commissioner Heitzman stated that he will have the draft completed soon for submittal to IHPA. The nomination includes a description of the building, its history and significance as designed by Harry Weese, and why it's significant at less than 50 years.

Commissioner Nally arrived.

Envision Oak Park Comprehensive Plan: Commissioner Nally provided an update of the Plan Commission meeting which just adjourned. The Plan Commission received a presentation from the consultant Houseal Lavigne Associates. A Comprehensive Plan serves as the Village's official guide for land use, physical improvements, local services and development and provides a foundation for decision-making based on community consensus, community vision, existing conditions and future potentials for the next 10-15 years. There has been significant public outreach, and they recently completed a series of three workshops to develop general plan recommendations and more specific goals and objectives. There are four core values which will be incorporated throughout the document, one of which is Oak Park's history and character. They will continue collecting public feedback and will prepare implementation recommendations. The Plan Commission discussed including greater language encouraging a preservation ethic, which can be incorporated throughout the document.

1125-35 Lake Street (Colt Building): The Commission noted that this development was recently reported in the newspaper to be back on track. The developer Clark Street and the architect Fitzgerald Associates are proposing a mixed-use development that may be up to 10 stories. The Commission expressed an interest in participating in the design review. The design should reflect its context, which will be key.

Citizen Involvement Commission Awards will be held on Monday, July 29 at Village Hall. Congratulations to Chair Morris, who will be receiving the Chair of the Year Award. Everyone is encouraged to attend.

ADJOURN

Motion by Nally to adjourn. Second by Palese. Motion approved: 10-0.

AYE: Albrecht, Battoglia, Eakin, Heitzman, McGrath, Nally, Palese, Quinn, Sundling, Chair Morris

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 9:00 p.m. Minutes prepared by Douglas Kaarre.

U:\CPD_Strategic\Community Planning\HISTORIC PRESERVATION\HPC Agendas and Minutes\2013\2013 Minutes\07-11-13 HPC Minutes.docx